## COMMENTS ON THE PAPER: STRESS WAVE PROPAGATION IN RECTANGULAR BARS<sup>†</sup>

THE author presents interesting results using the collocation or point matching technique. It may prove useful to list some additional references dealing with applications of the same technique in other fields of technology. The determination of cutoff frequencies, wave functions and attenuation constants of electromagnetic waveguides of arbitrary simply and doubly connected cross sections has been studied by several authors and the collocation technique has been used quite extensively [1–6]. Axial-shear vibrations of infinitely long cylindrical rods have also been studied by the collocation technique. Baltrukonis [7] deals with a star-shaped boundary given by the equation

$$S(r, \theta) \equiv r - (a + b \cos 4\theta) = 0.$$

The circle is one curve of the family. The first four eigenvalues were calculated and plotted in function of the dimensionless parameter b/a. When b/a approaches zero the boundary is circular, for which the exact solution is known. This study shows that, for the problem under consideration, the calculated eigenvalues depend rather drastically on the distribution of points. Furthermore, little or no convergence is demonstrated for as many as seven collocation points taken within an octant of the boundary.

Jain [8] has introduced a new criteria for the collocation procedure. In this procedure one requires that the error at adjacent matching points be equal in magnitude but opposite in sign. Furthermore, the error at the matching points must be larger than that at any other point. This technique seems to yield better results than the straight collocation method [9]. Convergence of the technique when applied in the approximate solution of linear and non-linear differential equations has also been treated in several papers [10–12].

In summary it seems that for extremely complicated cross sections, the stability of the straight collocation method is questionable but improvement is possible by adding some mathematical "constraints" such as the "extremal point collocation" [8], "least squares" fit; integration along boundary segments [13]; integration along internal segments [14, 15], etc.

## PATRICIO A. LAURA

Associate Professor, Department of Mechanical Engineering, Catholic University, Washington, D.C. 20017. Also: Applied Mechanics Specialist, Code 945, N.S.R.D.C. (U.S. Navy), Carderock, Maryland.

<sup>†</sup>W. B. FRASER, Int. J. Solids Struct. 5, 379-397 (1969).

## REFERENCES

- H. Y. YEE and N. F. AUDEH, Cutoff frequencies of waveguides with arbitrary cross-section. Proc. Instn. elect. electron. Engrs 53, 637-638 (1965).
- [2] H. Y. YEE and N. F. AUDEH, Uniform waveguides with arbitrary cross-section considered by the pointmatching method. I.E.E. Trans. Microwave Theory Techn. MTT-13, 847-851 (1965).

- [3] N. F. AUDEH and J. A. FULLER, A study of uniform waveguides of arbitrary cross-sections by the pointmatching method. UARI Research Report No. 56, Univ. of Alabama, Huntsville, Alabama, May 1968.
- [4] P. A. LAURA, Application of the point-matching method in waveguide problems. *I.E.E.E. Trans. Microwave Theory Tech.* MTT-14, 251 (1966).
- [5] H. Y. YEE and N. F. AUDEH, Cutoff frequencies of eccentric waveguides. I.E.E.E. Trans. Microwave Theory Techn. MTT-14, 487-493 (1966).
- [6] R. H. T. BATES, The point-matching method for interior and exterior two-dimensional boundary value problems. I.E.E. Trans. Microwave Theory Techn. MTT-15, 185-187 (1967).
- [7] J. H. BALTRUKONIS, Axis shear vibrations of star-shaped bars by the collocation method. Hercules Powder Co., Salt Lake City, Utah, Rept. 4, 1963.
- [8] M. K. JAIN, On collocation method for physical problems. Proc. 6th Congr. Theoretical and Applied Mechanics on High Speed Computation Methods and Machines. (1960).
- [9] J. H. BALTRUKONIS, Axial shear vibrations of star-shaped bars by extremal-point collocation. Hercules Powder Co., Salt Lake City, Utah Rept. 5, 1964.
- [10] E. B. KARPILOVSKAYA, Convergence of the collocation method. Dokl. Akad. Nauk SSSR 4, 766-769 (1963).
- [11] G. VAINIKKO, The convergence and stability of the collocation method. *Differ. ur-niya* 1, 244–254 (1965). [12] G. VAINIKKO, The convergence of the collocation method for non-linear differential equations. USSR
- Comput. Math. math. Phys. 6, 47–58 (1968). [13] K. RAJAIAH and A. K. RAI, Effect of boundary condition description on convergence of solution in a boundary
- value problem. J. comput. Phys. 3, 190–201 (1968). [14] P. A. LAURA, On the determination of the natural frequency of a star-shaped membrane. J. aeronaut. Soc. (1964).
- [15] P. A. LAURA, Conformal mapping and the determination of cutoff frequencies of waveguides with arbitrary cross-section. Proc. Instn. elect. electron. Engrs 54, 1078-1080 (1966).